

# **REPORT ON THE MICHIGAN CHILD SUPPORT FORMULA**

April 12, 2002

**Submitted to:**

Michigan Supreme Court  
State Court Administrative Office  
309 N. Washington Square  
Lansing, Michigan 48909

**Submitted by:**

Policy Studies Inc.  
999 18th Street, Suite 1000  
Denver, CO 80202  
(303) 863-0900



Jane C. Venohr, Ph.D.  
Tracy E. Griffith, B.S., CLA

# Table of Contents

## Executive Summary

Economic Estimates of Child-Rearing Costs .....	ii
Economic Basis of Michigan Formula .....	ii
Updating of Guidelines Formulas and Schedules Since 1987 .....	ii
New Estimates of Child-Rearing Costs .....	iv
Guidelines Model.....	v
Michigan Formula Is Based on Income Shares Model .....	v
Guidelines Models in Bordering States.....	vi
New Guidelines Models.....	vi
Factors Considered in Guidelines .....	vii
Age of the Child .....	viii
Child's Health-Related Expenses.....	viii
Low-income Noncustodial Parents.....	viii
High-income Cases .....	ix
Adjustments for Other Minor Children and Stepchildren.....	ix
Adjustments for Shared-parenting Time .....	ix
Method for Annually Updating Guidelines.....	x
Recommendations .....	x

## Chapter I: Introduction

Economic Estimates of Child-Rearing Costs .....	2
Guidelines Model.....	3
Factors Considered in Guidelines .....	4
Method for Annually Updating Formula .....	4
Report Organization.....	4

## Chapter II: New Economic Data on Child-Rearing Expenditures

Estimates of Child-Rearing Expenditures.....	5
Data Used to Develop Estimates .....	5
Overview of the Estimates of Child-Rearing Expenditures .....	6
Estimates Based on Marginal Costs .....	7
Per Capita Measurements .....	12
Summary of Estimates .....	14
Choice of Estimators.....	16
Other Issues Pertaining to Estimates of Child-Rearing Expenditures .....	17
(1) Use of national data for state guidelines.....	17
(2) Use of data from intact families to determine child support levels.....	17
(3) Schedule amounts for four or more children.....	19
Comparisons to Michigan Formula .....	20

## **Chapter III: Other States' Child Support Formulas**

Guidelines Models .....	29
Percentage-of-Obligor Income .....	30
Income Shares .....	30
Delaware Melson.....	31
Hybrid Model .....	31
Economic Basis of Child Support Schedules .....	32
Comparisons with Surrounding States .....	33
Overview of States Guidelines in the Comparison.....	34
Comparison of Schedule Amounts .....	37
Comparisons with the Melson Formula and Hybrid Formula.....	43
Delaware's Application of the Melson Formula.....	43
Massachusetts' Application of the Hybrid Approach.....	43
Graphical Comparisons of the Melson Formula and Hybrid Approach.....	49

## **Chapter IV: Alternative Guidelines Models**

Cost Shares Model.....	55
History .....	55
Theoretical Differences between the Cost Shares and Income Shares.....	56
Overview of the Models .....	57
Differences in the Economic Underpinnings.....	60
Similarities in the Models .....	67
Conclusions about the Cost Shares Model.....	67
American Law Institute's Model .....	72
ALI's Criticism of Marginal Cost Estimates of Child Rearing.....	72
Premise of ALI Formula.....	72
Conclusions about the ALI Formula .....	73

## **Chapter 5: Adjustments for Selected Special Factors and Annual Updating Method**

Age of the Child.....	75
Age Adjustments in Other State Guidelines .....	77
Children's Health Care Expenses .....	77
Health Insurance Premium.....	78
Ordinary and Extraordinary Medical Expenses .....	79
Recommendations of the Medical Child Support Working Group .....	83
Adjustments for Low-Income Noncustodial Parents .....	86
Minimum Orders .....	87
Low-Income Adjustments above Minimum-Order Incomes .....	89
High-Income Cases .....	95
Other Minor Children and Stepchildren .....	96
Other Minor Children .....	96
Stepchildren .....	97

Adjustments for Shared-Parenting Time.....	97
Shared-Parenting Time Adjustments in Other States.....	98
Annual Updating Method.....	99
Annual Update of Income Brackets.....	100
Health Care Support Supplement.....	102
Updating in Other States .....	102

## **Chapter 6: Conclusions and Recommendations**

New Evidence on Child-Rearing Expenditures .....	103
Historical Overview.....	103
Overview of Methodologies to Estimate Child-Rearing Costs.....	104
New Evidence on Child-Rearing Costs.....	104
Recommendation Concerning New Evidence on Child-Rearing Costs.....	106
Guidelines Models .....	107
Considerations of Original Michigan Committee .....	107
New Guidelines Models.....	108
Recommendations about Alternative Guidelines Models.....	109
Adjustments for Special Factors.....	109
Age of the Child .....	109
Child's Medical Expenses .....	110
Low-Income Noncustodial Parents .....	112
High Income Cases.....	114
Adjustments for Other Minor Children and Stepchildren.....	114
Shared-parenting Time.....	115
Annual Updating Method.....	115

## List of Exhibits

Exhibit II-1: Family Consumption Expenditures and Income .....	5
Exhibit II-2: Summary of Estimates Using Engel Estimator.....	10
Exhibit II-3: Summary of Estimates Using Rothbarth Estimator.....	11
Exhibit II-4: Summary of Estimates Using USDA Method .....	14
Exhibit II-5: Summary of Estimates of Child-Rearing Expenditures.....	15
Exhibit II-6: Percent of Net Income for One Child .....	16
Exhibit II-7: Comparison of Multipliers for Four or More Children .....	20
Exhibit II-8: One Child, Obligee Income = \$0.....	23
Exhibit II-9: Two Children, Obligee Income = \$0 .....	24
Exhibit II-10: Three Children, Obligee Income = \$0 .....	25
Exhibit II-11: Two Children, Obligee Income = 50% of Obligor Income .....	26
Exhibit II-12: Two Children, Obligee Income = Obligor Income .....	27
Exhibit III-1: Application of Child Support Guidelines Models.....	29
Exhibit III-2: Example of Income Shares Calculation.....	30
Exhibit III-3: Example of Melson Calculation.....	31
Exhibit III-4: Child-rearing Cost Estimates Underlying Income Shares States .....	33
Exhibit III-5: Assumptions Underlying Child Support Schedules in Comparison States .....	34
Exhibit III-6: One Child, Obligee's Income = \$0 .....	44
Exhibit III-7: Two Children, Obligee's Income = \$0 .....	45
Exhibit III-8: Three Children, Obligee's Income = \$0.....	46
Exhibit III-9: Two Children, Obligee's Income = 50% of Obligor's Income .....	47
Exhibit III-10: Two Children, Obligee's Income = Obligor's Income .....	48
Exhibit III-11: Two Children, Obligee's Income = \$0 (Hybrid and Melson) .....	52
Exhibit III-12: Two Children, Obligee's Income = 50% of Obligor's Income .....	53
Exhibit III-13: Two Children, Obligee's Income = Obligor's Income .....	54
Exhibit IV-1: Example of Income Shares Calculation.....	57
Exhibit IV-2: Example of Cost Shares Calculation .....	59
Exhibit IV-3: Comparison of Income Shares and Cost Shares Models .....	62
Exhibit IV-4: Example of Ability to Pay Calculation in Cost Shares Model .....	66
Exhibit IV-5: Impact of the Low Income Adjustment in Cost Shares Model .....	66
Exhibit IV-6: One Child, Obligee's Income = 50% if Obligor's Income.....	69
Exhibit IV-7: Two Children, Obligee's Income = 50% of Obligor's Income .....	70
Exhibit IV-8: Three Children, Obligee's Income = 50% of Obligor's Income .....	71
Exhibit V-1: Relative Costs of Younger and Older Children .....	76
Exhibit V-2: State Treatment of the Child's Health Insurance Premium .....	78
Exhibit V-3: State Treatment of the Child's Extraordinary Medical Expenses.....	80
Exhibit V-4: Examples of Definitions of the Child's Extraordinary Medical Expenses .....	84
Exhibit V-5: Low-Income Adjustments in Child Support Guidelines .....	87
Exhibit V-6: % of Poverty After Taxes and Child Support (Existing Colorado) .....	92
Exhibit V-7: % of Poverty After Taxes and Child Support (Proposed Colorado) .....	93
Exhibit V-8: % of Poverty After Taxes and Child Support (Existing Michigan).....	94
Exhibit V-9: % of Poverty After Taxes and Child Support (Equalization) .....	95
Exhibit V-10: Changes in the Income Bracket in Michigan Schedule.....	100
Exhibit V-11: Percentage Increase in Various Indices from 1988 to 2000 .....	101

---

## **Appendices**

Appendix I: Comparisons of Michigan Guideline to Various Estimators for One and Children

Appendix II: Comparison of Michigan Guideline to Other States for One and Three Children

Appendix III: Comparisons of Shared-Parenting Time Formulas

Appendix IV: Proposed Michigan Formulas Using 1996-1998 Data Updated to 2001  
Price Levels: Engel and Rothbarth Estimators